



Metro Council

Animal Services Ad-Hoc Committee

COMMITTEE REPORT:

REVIEW OF METRO ANIMAL SERVICES

December 17, 2014

Committee Members:

Co-Chair Cindi Fowler, District 14
Co-Chair Kelly Downard, District 16
David James, District 6
Tina Ward Pugh, District 9
Kevin Kramer, District 11
Marilyn Parker, District 18
Madonna Flood, District 24



Metro Council

Animal Services Ad-Hoc Committee

Committee Report: Review of Metro Animal Services

Table of Contents

1. Preamble
2. Conclusions of Committee
3. Recommendations of Committee
4. Findings of Fact / Timeline
5. Summary of Persons involved in review
6. Appendix



Metro Council
Animal Services Ad-Hoc Committee

Chapter 1

Preamble

Metro Council Ad-Hoc Committee on Animal Services

Report - Preamble

In August 2014, an article appeared in a public blog accusing Louisville Metro Animal Services management of animal cruelty. Because the article was accompanied by actual copies of emails and other evidence, not just opinions, Councilmembers Cindi Fowler and Kelly Downard requested and received approval to investigate the matter further. Shortly thereafter, President Jim King appointed an Ad-Hoc Committee on Animal Services to be co-chaired by Councilmembers Fowler and Downard. The anticipated timeline for the Committee to complete a review was 2-3 months, but soon after its formation, the Committee met one roadblock after another that prevented quick resolution of the inquiry and at times seemed designed to halt the investigation altogether.

The additional members of the Committee were Councilmembers Madonna Flood, David James, Kevin Kramer, Marilyn Parker and Tina Ward-Pugh. The Committee chairs developed goals and were provided enormous staff support by Elizabeth Kinney Hoffman, Steve Haag, Michael Bowman and Debbie Carroll.

Goals:

1. Investigate the accusations of animal cruelty.
2. Review alleged violations of the Open Records Law.
3. Review whether the Metro Donation Policy was followed on specific donations.
4. Determine the validity of the alleged atmosphere of fear at LMAS. See what protections do or don't exist for whistleblowers in Metro government.
5. If there was animal cruelty, seek the causation in order to make changes to prevent a reoccurrence.

The Committee developed a list of people to interview, documents to be requested and scheduled its first meeting for August 27, 2014.

This document represents the conclusions and recommendations drawn from totality of information, both testimony and documents, made available to the Ad-Hoc Committee on Animal Services during the course of the investigation into the aforementioned allegations.



Metro Council
Animal Services Ad-Hoc Committee

Chapter 2

Conclusions of Committee

Metro Council Ad-Hoc Committee on Animal Services

Report - Conclusions

In August, members of the Committee began looking into the events surrounding a dog named "Sadie" who was left in the care of Louisville Metro Animal Services, after allegations of negligence in its oversight to provide medical treatment that ultimately caused her untimely death surfaced. Even more disturbing to the committee was the discovery of more serious concerns from both former and current employees- along with animal care groups- regarding retaliation, the lack of adherence to formal donation policies, and significant questions and concerns surrounding Open Records requests and retention policies. All of these concerns appear to be a pattern within the LMAS Department dating back to the Mayor's initial review of the department in 2011.

In addition, the dedication, time, and effort members of this Committee put forth towards obtaining all the documentation and related materials regarding the initial concerns about LMAS and the events surrounding "Sadie" was considerable and made more difficult by the lack of cooperation by members of the Administration. This forced the Committee to evaluate the Council's "investigative powers," pursuant to KRS 67C.130 (13)(f), as a last resort to find a means to compel and acquire that documentation, some of which to this date has still not been provided. Ultimately, this has left the committee to question why this has been such a painstaking process to simply obtain information that should have been made available from the very start.

The Committee continued to work diligently despite these obstacles to allow for all the documentation and individual testimony relevant to the situation, including the results of the Public Integrity Unit (PIU) investigation, to be reviewed. The PIU investigation is complete and the report has been delivered to the Commonwealth's Attorney for action, but remains unavailable to this Committee at this time. The Committee believes it is a critical function of the legislative body to provide oversight and ensure accountability so that similar situations in LMAS, or any other Louisville Metro department, can be prevented.

The Ad-Hoc Committee on Animal Services has, following a thorough and deliberate review of the testimony and findings of fact, made the following conclusions:

1. The Louisville Metro Council as the governing legislative body has jurisdiction to "make independent audits and investigations concerning the affairs of the consolidated local government," pursuant to KRS 67C.103 (13)(f).
2. The Louisville Metro Council can, has, and will continue to exercise its authority to investigate the Louisville Metro Animal Services (LMAS) department through all means that are necessary and proper.
3. The LMAS Department has a statutory obligation to provide appropriate services to animals in their charge, including through local ordinance authority (LMCO Chapter 91)

4. Louisville Metro Government, through the Executive Branch, has adopted the Commonwealth of Kentucky “Whistleblower” Statute KRS 61.102, as the policy of the consolidated local government.
 - a. The Louisville Metro Council Ad-Hoc Committee on Animal Services (the Committee) expects that all individuals who have provided documents and testimony will remain protected by this policy.
 - b. The Committee has identified that the only protection available to employees is through the executive policy.
5. The Committee through testimony and findings of fact, has determined that there are significant issues in the structure and policies of the LMAS Department, including:
 - a. Failure to follow donation procedures and account for designated donations.
 - b. Failure to produce and maintain appropriate records.
 - c. Lack of clear, defined leadership following the resignation of Director Justin Scally.
6. The Committee, through testimony and findings of fact, has determined that there are significant issues in the Executive Branch, regarding policies and structure, including:
 - a. Failure to provide adequate records upon request, as required by the Kentucky Open Records Act.
 - b. Failures to properly oversee, investigate, and provide accountability for subordinate departments.
 - c. Misrepresentation of the findings and actions taken by the Administration, specifically Chief Sadiqa Reynolds, regarding the internal review and timeline of events.
 - d. Failure to fully observe donations policy and account for designated donations and a need for an improved and clearly defined donations policy Metro-wide.
 - e. Failure to define a clear leadership structure within the LMAS Department after the resignation of Director Justin Scally.
7. The “Internal Review” performed by Chief Sadiqa Reynolds was inadequate in addressing the issues within the LMAS Department.
 - a. Based on the foregoing findings of fact, the Committee concludes that by the clear and convincing evidence made available, Chief Reynolds’ investigation was inadequate to conform to established policies. There is a significant and concerning lack of documentation to support that any action was taken to investigate or rectify the allegations regarding the dog Sadie or the employee issues.
8. The allegation that the LMAS Department neglected a pit bull dog named Sadie, by denying immediate care that is required under statute, KRS 525.130.
 - a. Based on the foregoing findings of fact, the Committee concludes that by the clear and convincing evidence made available, the LMAS Department did knowingly neglect Sadie by failing to provide proper health care for the animal in a timely fashion.
9. The allegation that Ms. Heather Adkins failed to follow LMAS Department policies and provide adequate guardianship of Sadie.
 - a. Based on the foregoing findings of fact, the Committee concludes that by the clear and convincing evidence made available, that Ms. Adkins acquitted herself in an acceptable manner in an effort to provide proper care for Sadie.

- b. The available evidence clearly shows Ms. Adkins repeatedly seeking guidance and assistance from superiors within the LMAS Department, to no avail, and was left with no other alternative than to pursue a separate course of action to seek care for Sadie.
10. The allegation that management of the LMAS Department, specifically Assistant Director Donald Robinson and Senior Manager of Special Initiatives and Communication Margaret Brosko, improperly disciplined an employee- Ms. Heather Adkins- through claims of failure to follow established LMAS policies.
 - a. Based on the foregoing findings of fact, the Committee concludes that by the clear and convincing evidence made available, the management of the LMAS Department improperly disciplined Ms. Adkins for actions taken in providing care for Sadie.



Metro Council
Animal Services Ad-Hoc Committee

Chapter 3

Recommendations of Committee

Report - Recommendations

Following a thorough and deliberate review of the testimony and findings of fact, The Ad-Hoc Committee on Animal Services, hereby issues the following RECOMMENDATIONS to the Office of the Mayor, Louisville Metro Council and the Louisville Metro Animal Services Department:

1. **That the Mayor's Office makes a public statement commending the actions of Heather Adkins in regards to how she tried to save "Sadie".**

All documents reviewed by the Animal Services Ad-Hoc Committee have shown that Ms. Heather Adkins acted in the best interest of the dog, "Sadie" that she fostered and any failures to assist Sadie in getting proper treatment were because of the actions/inactions of employees of Metro Government. We ask that the Mayor's Office express this opinion publically, to clear Ms. Adkins name, to advert any perceived inadequacies that may prejudice a future employer regarding her ability to work with animals.

2. **Immediate corrections are made to Heather Adkins Personnel File exonerating her of any wrong doing regarding the situation with "Sadie".**

This includes removing any and all retaliatory administrative actions taken against Adkins for her efforts to save "Sadie" including working with the Arrow Fund and speaking up publically. A copy of the public statement commending her efforts and restoring her reputation shall be included in the file. Finally, the notation on her application "**Do not rehire**" shall also be removed from the personal file.

3. **The Mayor's Office acknowledge that the following statement, taken from a press release on behalf of Mayor Fischer on August 20, 2014 was factually inaccurate:** "Fischer said his team examined allegations surrounding Sadie when they first surfaced earlier this summer and determined that employees did nothing improper".

Given that only one person conducted the review with merely the individuals in question, it is inconceivable to conclude "employees did nothing improper" as stated within the above mentioned release.

- 4. The Administration makes policy changes to adhere to the Kentucky Open Records Act ensuring Metro Policies are followed and written in accordance with State Law.**

Policy changes should include adjustment to internal policies regarding storage of e-mails, retention of employee records after separation from Metro. (See memo from legal counsel regarding records retention and ORR)

- 5. That the Administration provide ALL documents pertaining to the dog named, "Sadie" to the Animal Services Ad-Hoc Committee.**

This request should include any reports, reviews, memos, e-mails or other correspondence related to the treatment of Sadie, raising funds for her surgery, personnel matters and other types of paperwork associated with LMAS. Items that have not been delivered to the Animal Services Committee include (but are certainly not limited to)

- Correspondence generated by the following persons: Sadiqa Reynolds, Donald Robinson and Margaret Brosko. (Other names to add – i.e. Vaughn, Oerther, Wolf, etc....)
- LMAS Paperwork summarizing in home visit(s) and any other observations regarding Sadie by Margaret Brosko and anyone at LMAS as part of Metro policy for fosters animal guardians.
- All documentation that was used to assemble the timeline of events prepared by the Mayor's Communications Office and distributed to the media. Many references were made to events and materials that the Animal Services Ad Hoc Committee is unaware of, and would like to see so as to back up the claims made within the timeline.
- Copy of notice of violation and any documents pertaining to the actions taken against the owner of Sadie, who later relinquished ownership privileges after Sadie was turned in a second time without having received treatment on leg.

- 6. The Administration agrees to make employees Margaret Brosko, Donald Robinson and any other Metro Employee available that is noted within the PIU Investigation or Report of the Metro Auditor to speak to the Animal Services Ad-Hoc Committee once the PIU and Internal Auditor have concluded their investigations into this matter.**

- 7. The Metro Council will create a new Whistleblower Ordinance that shall reflect the State Whistleblower Ordinance and shall give employees the right to either take their complaint to the Metro Ethics Commission or to Circuit Court as prescribed in State Law and establish a means for employees to use the anonymous tip line to provide information on how to move forward with such a concern.**

8. That the Metro Council develops policies and procedures in relation to investigatory powers regarding their ability to compel the production of documentation and testimony.

9. Greater oversight of financial accountability and an amended Donation Policy

The committee seeks amendments to policies related to the donations received by Metro Louisville to ensure the proper collection, use and notification for each grant, donation or other contribution to Metro Louisville.

10. That the Animal Services Ad-Hoc Committee be allowed to extend beyond the end of this year to complete its work regarding testimony from key personnel and the review of the PIU investigation.



Metro Council
Animal Services Ad-Hoc Committee

Chapter 4

Findings of Fact / Timeline

Metro Council Ad-Hoc Committee on Animal Services

Report – Findings of Fact / Timeline

Following a thorough and deliberate review of the testimony and information collected by the members and staff for the Louisville Metro Council's Ad-Hoc Committee on Animal Services, the committee hereby issues the following Findings of Fact/Timeline of Events.

- February 3, 2013 Sadie (Female - Pit Bull Mix) turned in by citizen to LMAS at Manslick Shelter, as stray animal with injury to right front leg that required amputation. Dog was apparently micro chipped which allowed LMAS to contact owner.
- Dr. Patricia Kennedy / Dr. Cheever of Jefferson Animal Hospital examines Sadie. Female Pit Bull HBC was diagnosed with lameness in right front leg at point of shoulder. Mild bruising on leg. Possible old injury with hairline fracture. May require amputation if permanent deficits continue. Returned dog to LMAS same day. (Appx. 5)
- February 14, 2013 Owner was identified by LMAS, Owner retrieved the animal, taking dog home. (Appx. 3,13,15)
- Owner of Sadie claims Sadie and receives a violation notice for injuries to leg. Violation was given because owner didn't seek medical attention for animal within 48 hours of visit to veterinarian. No further action against owner is believed to have been taken although a warrant and fine are required by law.
- May 2013 Justin Scaly resigns as head of LMAS(Appx. 14).
- August 29, 2013 Sadie is again collected as stray by LMAS officer. (Appx. 13)
- September 3, 2013 Owner renounced ownership of animal, stating that "she was abandoning the dog and was hopeful LMAS would give the dog a good home". (Appx. 15)
- September 6, 2013 Euthanasia recommended by the Animal Care staff (for time and space). (Appx. 15)
- Sadie sent to Jefferson Animal Hospital (4505 Outer Loop) and was either going to be put to sleep or have leg amputated.
- September 7, 2013 Heather Adkins, employee at LMAS takes Sadie for up to 6 months of foster care, as LMAS began PR to raise money for medical treatment of dog. (Appx. 5)
- September 29, 2013 Kim Ward sends e-mail to Heather Adkins stating "Don't spend your money on it yet. I think we can justify this from a PR standpoint and use the donation someone gave us to help with the cost" (Appx. 5)
- Donation for \$250 was given to LMAS for the purpose of assisting a pit bull. Donation doesn't show up in database until months later, and was used on another animal. No documentation to show that the funds were used on a pit bull were disclosed to the committee. (Appx. 5,19)

- October 10, 2013 According to administration (no documents available to substantiate) - LMAS conducts a foster home visit per policies and procedures. No documentation provided regarding this occurrence, nor any notes regarding the state of Sadie. (Appx. 15)
- October 14, 2013 Kim Ward, Adoption Coordinator, tells Heather Adkins via e-mail - Brosko was, "going to push the story and it will probably be pretty big." (Appx. 5)
- November 11, 2013 Sadie self-mutilates leg, chewing through bandage and skin on paw. Sadie is issued protective e-collar to prevent self-mutilation. (Appx. 3,5)
- November 13, 2013 Ms. Adkins stated her personal veterinarian would do surgery for \$575. (Appx. 5)
- Nov – Dec 2013 Sadie chews through e-collar on multiple occasions to self-mutilate injured leg/paw. Heather Adkins makes multiple visits to her personal vet, Dr. Stephanie Pollett of East Bullet Veterinary Clinic. (Appx. 3,5,13)
- December 14, 2013 E-mail - Kim Ward appears to have also attempted to get Brosko to help Sadie and told Adkins via email that the situation was "becoming an issue of neglect on our part, as far as I'm concerned." (Appx. 5)
- December 15, 2013 Adkins e-mailed foster coordinator stating she e-mailed management twice with no response. (Appx. 5)
- December 17, 2013 According to administration (no records or persons offered to corroborate this claim) After numerous attempts to reach the potential pro-bono veterinarian failed, LMAS alerted Ms. Adkins and explained that a different approach was needed to save Sadie. (no identification of what this different approach was). Committee spoke with veterinarian mentioned as point of contact, and they denied that there was contact with LMAS during this period. (Appx. 15)
- December 17, 2013 Heather Adkins appeals via e-mail to Margaret Brosko to start a "email/facebook campaign to my family and friends asking for donations to MAS towards Sadie's surgery. Am I allowed to do that?" told via e-mail from Brosko that "the donation money is immediately processed so now our option is to wait for another donation and see if someone is willing to fund the surgery, I can also ask our SPOT advisory board to help" No mention in SPOT Board minutes and no other e-mails to substantiate that any other action took place. (Appx. 5)
- December 18, 2013 Heather Adkins e-mailed LMAS to state that her personal vet surgery would cost \$545. Adkins also stated her vet could do surgery same day. (Appx. 5)

- December 29, 2013 Kim Ward in e-mail to Margaret Brosko and Alisa Oerther e-mail: "Heather has told me that Sadie is chewing off her toenails and constantly mutilating it. Are we still able to get the surgery done as we had told we would?". No replies or acknowledgment of this e-mail has been delivered to Metro Council. (Appx. 5)
- Administration claim – "via phone conversation, Ms. Adkins informed LMAS that Sadie's condition had worsened, but her personal veterinarian wrapped the leg and said surgery could wait until the funds were raised." No corroborating records have been provided to committee to support this claim. (Appx. 15)
- Late December 2013 Margaret Brosko sends e-mail to Heather Adkins allowing her to start raising funds for Sadie's Surgery. (Appx. 5)
- Jan-Feb 2014 Sadie had again (twice in short period of time) chewed through her protective head cone and chewed on her own injured leg. Sadie ended up suffering from an obstructed bowel from ingesting bandages administered to animal due to self-mutilation to relieve leg pain. Sadie was later euthanized at least partially because of this event. Sadie makes multiple trips to veterinarian in attempts to address leg wounds and pneumonia which set in on February 27th. (Appx. 3,5,13)
- February 21, 2014 LMAS processed \$200 in donations to SPOT board for surgery (no documentation offered to show notification of intent to board, nor is there any documentation to show how "Ms. Adkins was notified" Administration also claims two checks were returned (Date of return occurred after September 6, 2014 – when ad-hoc committee met regarding donations and raised the issue of donations made for a specific purpose and how those funds failed to be used in accordance with the wishes of the donor.) (Appx. 15,19)
- February 28, 2014 Amanda Crook, Animal Adoptions Coordinator gives oral confirmation that Arrow Fund could accept ownership/responsibility to seek treatment of Sadie. According to Arrow Fund Facebook account of events, ownership of dog was addressed prior to animal being handed over or treatment being administered by veterinarians. Senior LMAS Management denies that this occurred and used this as a means for disciplinary action against Heather Adkins.
- February 28, 2014 Sadie euthanized at Blue Pearl private Animal Hospital. (Appx. 1,13)
- March 1, 2014 Arrow Fund posts the story of Sadie's treatment and eventual euthanasia on Facebook. Administration claims, this post represented LMAS first notification of this "unfortunate event". (Appx. 1,13)
- April-June 2014 4 Open records request(s) filed related to this case by Karen Dickson requesting information that was either denied or heavily redacted. (Appx. 13)
- Meeting between Adkins and LMAS Management and Union Steward regarding Adkins calling Arrow Fund Occurs. (Appx. 3)

- May 2014 According to Heather Adkins: A month later, Robinson again called Adkins into his office to reprimand her over the open records requests LMAS was beginning to receive. He allegedly told her that if she wasn't his "star employee" he would fire her for bringing negative attention and bad press to LMAS. But he wouldn't get that opportunity. Heather Adkins left LMAS a few weeks later, still heartbroken over Sadie and disgusted by the treatment she received and the health care Sadie didn't receive. (Appx. 1)
- July 8, 2014 Margaret Brosko moved from position as Special Initiatives and Communications Manager at LMAS to Mayor's Communications Office "Please welcome Margaret Brosko to the Mayor's Communications Team. She will be the lead staff/body person for the Mayor during his many public appearances, helping juggle the Mayor's time and interactions with citizens. She will also have special communications assignments as time permits."
- July 22, 2014 TheVilleVoice.com reports first story giving details of events surrounding the death of the animal "Sadie" in post titled: "*The LMAS Official-Turned-Fischer-Staffer Scandal Gets Real*". (Appx. 13)
- July 28, 2014 Working in consultation with President Jim King, Councilmembers Downard and Fowler begin to meet with persons named within the VilleVoice.com post. Early meetings were scheduled to assist in the authentication of statements and documents presented in online stories and to help further understand the events leading up to the euthanasia of the dog "Sadie".
- August 12, 2014 Councilmembers Fowler and Downard contact Metro Internal Auditor Ingram Quick to discuss the possibility of his department conducting a study of LMAS. Committee members were told that an anonymous report had triggered such a study a few weeks prior and that the Office of the Internal Auditor was taking care of the financial portion of the tip and that the Public Integrity Unit (PIU) had been looking into the aspects of the tip that dealt with animal cruelty and neglect.
- August 19, 2014 President Jim King establishes Animal Services Ad-Hoc Committee naming Councilman Kelly Downard and Councilwoman Cindi Fowler Co-Chairs for the group. (Appx. 2)
- August 20, 2014 Office of Mayor released press release titled: "Mayor Requests Review of Alleged Animal Services Incident" in which the Mayor is quoted as saying "his team examined the allegations surrounding Sadie when they first surfaced earlier this summer and determined that employees did nothing improper." The press statement also went on to call for "a review by the Public integrity Unit" to "answer all of the questions that have been raised by my team, the public and the Metro council". (Appx. 2)
- August 22, 2014 Letters to Sadiqa Reynolds, Steve Rowland, Donald Robinson and Margaret Brosko inviting them to speak to the Committee as well as requesting all pertinent information regarding "Sadie" are delivered to each person's respective office. (Appx. 12)

- August 27, 2014 Metro Council Animal Services Ad-Hoc Committee holds first meeting
- September 30, 2014 Animal Services Committee is briefed by Legal Counsel to the committee, Mr. Greg Hovious on the powers of the legislative branch in obtaining documents. Committee also reviews first draft of "Sadie's Law" which was drafted to offer Metro "Whistleblowers" the ability to seek corrective measures through both the courts and through an administrative body (Ethics Commission). (Appx. 7)
- October 13, 2014 During meeting of Animal Services Committee, Legal Counsel to the committee, Mr. Greg Hovious delivered and explained four memos. The topics of those memos were 1) Records Retention Law, 2) Kentucky Open Records Act, 3) How the Kentucky Open Records Act and Subpoena Powers Relate to one Another, and 4) KRS 67C.103. During meeting Hovious also outlines multiple e-mails that were provided to the committee that contained information not provided previously to Karen Dickson under Kentucky Open Records Law. Documents provided to the press by the Administration outlining the Mayor's Office timeline of events were also discussed, as references to documents that were not provided nor noted as being protected were mentioned. (Appx. 7)
- October 22, 2014 Ad Hoc Committee Co-Chairs Fowler and Downard deliver letter to Mayor's Administration outlining "nine items that resulted from the hearings to date". The nine items outlined within the letter had been previously agreed to by members of the committee and were discussed in a meeting between committee members and representatives of the Mayor's Office on October 15, 2014. The meeting did result in members receiving a proposal for a change in the Metro donations policy which was shared with committee members for comment. (Appx. 4)
- October 22, 2014 Mayor Announces the hiring of three persons to leadership positions within the Louisville Metro Animal Services Department. Jessica Montgomery (Director), Stephanie Moore (Animal Care) and Daisy Blakeman (Enforcement). Members of the Metro Council are introduced to each shortly before the start of the Mayor's press conference to make the announcement of the hiring.
- November 7, 2014 Downard and Fowler send letter to Mayoral Chief of Staff Ellen Hessen and Chief Financial Officer Steve Rowland seeking a reply from the administration on the remaining eight items the committee felt were in need of attention and outlined in a letter from committee members to the administration in October. Members also delivered to the administration their suggested changes to the proposed Metro Donations policy. Changes included lowering the threshold for documentation of donations and additional protections to ensure that earmarked donations are spent appropriately. (Appx. 7)

December 17, 2014 Animal Services Ad Hoc Committee holds final meeting of year. Committee releases report written as a result of information available to the committee as a result of their review. Members of the ad-hoc committee expect that committee will continue to seek answers and clarity on events covered in this report once the Public Integrity Unit, Internal Auditor and persons involved in this matter who had declined to participate in the committee have made themselves available to answer questions regarding this matter.

Adverse Inference Statement:

An adverse inference is a legal inference, adverse to the concerned party , drawn from a party's silence or absence of requested evidence (definitions. uslegal.com) In the case of a party's refusal to testify , an adverse inference is an inference that, if the party had answered the question put to him/her, the answers would have been unfavorable to her/him. If a witness in a civil administrative proceeding properly asserts a Fifth Amendment privilege against testifying, the fact finder may draw an adverse inference from the witness's failure to testify. Such an adverse inference , however, may only be drawn when independent evidence exists of the fact to which the party refuses to answer. *Doe v Glazer*, 232 F.3d 1258 (9th Cir.2000)



Metro Council
Animal Services Ad-Hoc Committee

Chapter 5

**Summary of Persons
Involved in Review**

Report – Persons Referenced within Report

METRO / LMAS Employees

Sadiqa Reynolds – Mayor’s Cabinet Member, Chief of Community Building, Oversees LMAS among other Metro Departments. Person identified as having “examined allegations surrounding Sadie when they first surfaced earlier this summer and determined that employees did nothing improper.”

Steve Rowland – Metro Government Chief Financial Advisor. Spoke with Animal Services Ad Hoc Committee on multiple occasions. His department oversaw financial accounting for donations received by LMAS as well as responses to Open Records Requests. Has worked with committee members on providing amendments to improve Metro Government’s Policy regarding donations.

Justin Scally – Director of LMAS part of time (July 2011 through May 2013). Left LMAS to take position as head of the American Humane Association's Red Star Emergency Services program, which assists animals in disasters. Top position at LMAS was left vacant until approximately 18 months later (October 22, 2014) when Jessica Jo Montgomery was named as Director for LMAS.

Donald Robinson – LMAS Assistant Director, Moved to Louisville from Tampa, FLA to work in LMAS in July 2011. Robinson has 10 years of experience in managing operations in union and non-union environments. He worked for Allied Automotive Group in Tampa and formerly worked for the same company in Louisville, also believed to have a military background. Robinson has been described as the interim, acting and assistant director by various persons over the course of the Metro Council Committee’s review of the facts involving actions at LMAS. It was announced during the Mayor’s Press Conference to bring in new leadership at LMAS that Mr. Robinson would be moving to another, unnamed department.

Margaret Brosko – LMAS Special Initiatives and Communications Manager, Second in command at LMAS during this period. Moved to the Mayor’s Office in Communications as the Mayor’s “body man” in July of 2014, previously worked at Metro Parks before going to LMAS in July of 2011.

Kim Ward - Foster Coordinator for LMAS, left LMAS approximately (summer 2014) and moved out of town. Ms. Ward could not be reached for comment by co-chairs of the Animal Services Committee.

Alisa Oerther – Former LMAS Community Engagement Supervisor. Left Metro Government in summer of 2014. Currently is employed with the Kentucky Humane society as a Donor Relations Manager.

Karen Dickson – Started as a volunteer, moved to position of Volunteer Coordinator (June 2009 – July 2011). Position eliminated. Was supervised by Margaret Brosko while at LMAS. Author of multiple Kentucky Open Records Requests for information from LMAS with some focus on “Sadie”. Challenged results from Metro Government’s response to her requests and subsequently was given additional information. Provided information to Animal Services Committee Co-Chairs that assisted in research on the merits of some of the accusations made in articles posted on www.thevillevoice.com.

Sherri Goodman – Union Representative (Teamsters) at LMAS. Has represented multiple employees in matters involving disciplinary actions by Robinson and Brosko against LMAS employees.

Dee Allen – Louisville Metro Human Resources Employee – oversees Open Records Communications. Was not made available for comment by the administration. Questions directed towards her work on ORR involving LMAS were answered instead by Metro CFO Steve Rowland.

Nancy Barnes – Former LMAS Employee left after FMLA in July 2013. Served as adoption coordinator and was primarily located Manslick location while also working at the Newberg Facilities. Resigned from LMAS and has since filed multiple ORR via online forms. Presently works at Shelby County Animal Shelter.

Janet Dudick – E-mailed on 2-4-13 regarding severe damage to leg and additional nerve damage. Suggested money was needed to be able to save dog (not leg).

Amanda Crook – Adoption coordinator for Louisville Metro Animal Services. Was cited as person who gave guardianship for “Sadie” via phone call to Arrow Fund for treatment and eventual euthanasia due to injuries and lack of proper care for injured leg.

Tabatha Grey – LMAS VET supervisor

Rebecca Riggs – LMAS Adoption Supervisor, was direct supervisor to Nancy Barnes, no longer works as LMAS. Left LMAS in Fall 2013

LMAS Current Leadership - Jessica Jo Montgomery - Named as Director for LMAS on October 22, 2014. Stephanie Moore, assistant director of operations, and Daisey Blakeman, executive administrator were also named as new LMAS leadership team by Mayor Fischer at same press conference.

Animal Services Ad-Hoc Committee – Established on August 19, 2014 at the request of Metro Council President Jim King. Committee was co-chaired by Councilman Kelly Downard (District 16) and Councilwoman Cindi Fowler (District 14). Membership of committee included: Councilman David James (District 6), Councilwoman Tina Ward-Pugh (District 9), Councilman Kevin Kramer (District 11), Councilwoman Marilyn Parker (District 18) and Councilwoman Madonna Flood (District 24). The Ad-Hoc committee held six meetings during between August 27th and December 17th issuing a summary of findings as a result of those meetings at their final meeting of the 2014 calendar year. Continuation of the committees work and membership of the ad-hoc will be determined based on the election of Metro Council President and the selection of committee members by Caucus leadership following the 2015 Metro Council organizational meeting.

Ingram Quick – Louisville Metro Auditor. Conducted review of LMAS donation policies and other financial aspects of the department. Has yet to issue a report summarizing his findings for public review.

Public Integrity Unit – began working on review of LMAS following an anonymous report received to the Metro Anonymous Tip Line. PIU members Sgt. Rick Kessinger and Sgt. Andrew McClinton conducted interviews and collection of data prior to announcement of Animal Services Ad-Hoc Committee or announcement by Mayor's Office regarding "Sadie". As of December 2014, it is understood that the report of the PIU has been delivered to the Office of the Commonwealth Attorney and is awaiting their recommendation as to any action necessary. The Animal Services Ad Hoc Committee is awaiting the final report and decision regarding the PIU review prior to being able to conclude our work and also question persons unavailable to the committee due to concerns over statements that could be construed as self-incriminating. Committee members have agreed to delay any further testimony until the investigation of the PIU and Internal Auditors are complete.

Other persons associated with the review of Metro Animal Services

Jack Conway, Kentucky Attorney General – Has received numerous requests for assistance on receiving open records materials regarding LMAS. Karen Dickson has supposedly expressed intent to file complaint over redactions and lack of information provided in a complaint with OAG.

SPOT Board: 16 current members, Membership can be from 10-20 persons. Chair is selected by Mayor. Board is governed by open records and open meetings rules. Members include: Cathy Zion, Karen Little, Amber Halloran, Rudolph Davidson, Amy Wosotsky, Debbie Scoppechio, James Brammell, Julie Crutcher, Elizabeth "Betty" Brown, John Sheller, Beverly Johnson, Allison Jamison Woosley, Susan Sales, Jean Nelson, Phillip Koenig, Michael Schardein, Carol Schnell. Director of MLAS is an ex-officio member of the board/commission. Chair of Board is James Brammell (President of Louisville Water Co.) and the board treasurer is Amber Halloran (Louisville Water Company)

Funding for Sadie's surgery was to be run through the SPOT Board.

Dr. Patricia Kennedy – Jefferson Animal Hospital and Emergency Center Veterinary Doctor. Made original examination of Sadie on February 3, 2013.

Dr. Stephanie Pollett – Heather Adkin's personal veterinary doctor and person who was prepared to operate on Sadie. East Bullet Veterinary Clinic. Dr. Pollett examined and treated Sadie on multiple occasions over 6 months due to Sadie's self-mutilation of injured leg/paw.

Arrow Fund: Non-Profit organization that assisted Heather Adkins in euthanization of Sadie.

Rebecca Eaves – Arrow Fund, became involved in Sadie case when they took control of Sadie to put her down. Has been involved with LMAS on many endeavors/actions.

Greg Hovious / Mary Eade – Attorneys with the firm, Fultz Maddox Hovious & Dickens. Hired to assist the committee after questions regarding obtaining documents related to "Sadie" and LMAS that were being withheld from the committee.



Metro Council
Animal Services Ad-Hoc Committee

Chapter 6

Appendix

Report - Appendix

1. Letter from Heather Adkins regarding Sadie
2. Press release establishing the Ad-Hoc Committee and other releases regarding review
3. Heather Adkins Personnel File
4. Letters from Kelly Downard and Cindi Fowler to Ad-Hoc Committee members
5. Email exchanges referenced within this report involving LMAS/Sadie
6. Correspondence between Committee and Jefferson County Attorney's Office
7. Letters from Greg Hovious regarding authority of Metro Council
8. KRS 67C, 61.102, 61.103, 61.990
9. Louisville Metro Open Records Policy Information
10. Louisville Metro Government Personnel Policies related to retaliation
11. Tina Ward-Pugh and Jerry Miller letter to Mayor regarding ethics and response
12. Letters to Sadiqa Reynolds, Steve Rowland, Donald Robinson, and Margaret Brosko
13. Jake Payne Articles related to LMAS
14. Courier Journal Articles related to LMAS
15. Timeline of events surrounding Sadie as released by Mayor's Office to Media
16. Animal Services Organizational Chart and Job Descriptions
17. 2011 Mayor Greg Fischer's Performance review Committee Report on LMAS (2011)
18. LMAS Donations Policy
19. LMAS and SPOT Donations and Confirmations/Receipts